

## STAFF REPORT

DATE November 17, 2015  
PLACE 50 W Gay St  
TIME 3:00 pm

### A CALL TO ORDER

### B APPROVAL OF MINUTES

~3:00 Meeting Summary – October 20, 2015

### C OLD BUSINESS – Applications for CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL

~3:05 15-10-004 Address: 401 W Town  
Property Owner: Brick Investment Corporation  
Applicant: Chris Sherman  
To be reviewed: Exterior construction and building alterations, Change of use

**Sub-Districts:** West Broad St **Arts and Innovation** Dodge Park

**Code Reference:** 3323.19 Uses  
3323.21 Development Standards

**Staff Observations:**

401 W Town is a mixed use building that includes Strongwater Food and Spirits, artist work and sales space, office, and event space. The applicant is proposing a change of use for 2720 sq. ft. of the space. The new use will be an extension of Strongwater and will be classified as an eating and drinking establishment. In addition to the change of use, the application includes exterior alterations for the new space including new stairs and new windows.

The applicant is requesting a parking modification to reduce the required parking from 17 to 0 spaces.

Note: In January 2014, the applicant received approval for a change of use for 933 sq. ft. of bar space and an associated parking reduction of 10 spaces. The new space was not constructed and is now within the larger 2720 sq. ft. currently under review. The 10 space reduction granted by the EFRB in January 2014 has already been included in the current request for a total reduction of 27 spaces.

#### Applicable Code Land Use Standard:

Standard	Arts and Innovation	Staff Comments
Eating and drinking establishment	Permitted Use	Consistent

#### Applicable Plan Land Use Recommendation:

Standard	Arts and Innovation	Staff Comments
Neighborhood Mixed Use	16-45 du/acre	Consistent

**Applicable Code Development Standards:**

Standard	Art and Innovation District	Staff Comments
Parking	Eating and drinking = 1:75 SF 2720 SF = 36 spaces 25% reduction = 27 spaces 3 bicycle parking spaces  10 space parking reduction granted in January 2014	Applicant requesting parking reduction from 17 to 0 spaces  3 bicycle parking space provided

**Applicable Plan Development Standards:**

Recommendation	Standard	Staff Comments
Land Use Compatibility	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>When a proposed use is compatible with adjacent uses, it should be supported.</li> </ul>	Consistent
Architecture—Mixed-Use, Commercial, Multifamily and institutional buildings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Architecture should be provided that establishes and defines a building's appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>New construction should be integrated with the existing fabric and scale of development in surrounding neighborhoods.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Street-level facades are recommended to be as transparent as possible to create an attractive pedestrian environment, except for residential spaces on ground floors.</li> </ul>	Consistent
Parking	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Parking reductions may be appropriate for higher density, mixed use projects. Shared parking arrangements may be appropriate.</li> </ul>	Consistent
Lighting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Wall-mounted lights should be directed downward. Soffit-mounted light fixtures should be recessed in the soffit or otherwise fully shielded from view from any property line.</li> </ul>	Consistent

The proposed use of an eating and drinking establishment and associated exterior modifications are consistent with the recommendations of the EFCCD Plan. A reduction in parking is consistent with the East Franklinton District and contributes to the urban, walkable environment of East Franklinton and the reuse of an existing commercial warehouse. The applicant will provide the required 3 bicycle parking spaces. Staff recommends approval.

**Recommendations:**

Conceptual Approval

Approval

Approval with  
Conditions

Disapproval

**D APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL**

~3:20      15-11-001      Address:      491 W Town Street  
Property Owner:      Sullivant Brothers, LLC  
Applicant:      Zachary Price  
To be reviewed:      Demolition

**Sub-Districts:**      West Broad St      **Arts and Innovation**      Dodge Park

**Code Reference:**      3323.11 (H) Demolition Permits

**Staff Observations:**

The applicant is proposing demolition of a single-family home built around 1900 located at 491 W Town. The owner is currently performing due diligence on a multi-family or mixed use project for the site and has requested demolition to reduce insurance and maintenance costs until a new use is reviewed and approved.

**Demolition Permit Review:**

Standard	Staff Comments
Replacement use reviewed and approved by EFRB	No replacement use proposed
If no replacement structure or use is proposed, a plan detailing how the property will be maintained has been reviewed and approved by the Board.	Applicant proposes to fill and seed until future development plans are announced.
Is the property eligible for Columbus or National Registers of Historic Places?	Not eligible

**Recommendations:**      Conceptual Approval      **Approval**      Approval with Conditions      Disapproval

~3:30      15-11-002      Address:      421 W State  
Property Owner:      FDA Acquisition Corp 2011, LLC  
Applicant:      TRIAD Architects and Compton Construction  
To be reviewed:      Exterior construction and alterations

**Sub-Districts:**      West Broad St      **Arts and Innovation**      Dodge Park

**Code Reference:**      3323.11 Certificate of Approval - Required  
3323.21 Development Standards

**Staff Observations:**

The Columbus Idea Foundry is a community workshop, learning center, and creative space located at 421 W State. CIF currently uses the first floor of the building for manufacturing uses and has plans to expand to the second floor with a mix of uses in the near future. The application for exterior construction and alterations will allow the applicant to prepare for the future use change and includes the following items:

1. Replace windows in existing openings on the second floor and select first floor openings (as shown in application packet).
2. Replace windows in existing clerestory.
3. Construct a new clerestory for access to a future mezzanine on the second floor.
4. Install a new entrance with canopies and larger openings for retail space on north elevation.

Note: The proposed future uses include retail space on the first floor and office and event space on the second floor. The future change of use will require a parking modification by the Board of approximately 100 spaces or less. An application for Certificate of Approval for the change of use and graphics will be submitted at a future date; however, the applicant would like to discuss the items conceptually at the November meeting.

**Applicable Plan Development Standards:**

Recommendation	Standard	Staff Comments
Architecture—Mixed-Use, Commercial, Multifamily and institutional buildings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Architecture should be provided that establishes and defines a building's appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Historic and other contributing buildings should be preserved to the extent possible and if necessary, incorporated into new development.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All sides of a building should be coherently designed and treated. A consistent level of detailing and finish should be provided for all sides of a building ("foursided" architecture).</li> </ul>	Consistent

The proposed exterior construction and alterations are consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan. Staff recommends approval.

**Recommendations:**

Conceptual Approval

Approval

Approval with  
Conditions

Disapproval

**Conditions:**

~3:45

15-11-003

Address:

250, 254, and 258 S Grubb

Property Owner:

Dr. Robert Falcone

Applicant:

Michael T. Shannon

To be reviewed:

Change of use, exterior construction

**Sub-Districts:**

West Broad St

Arts and Innovation

Dodge Park

**Code Reference:**

3323.19 Uses

3323.21 Development Standards

**Staff Observations:**

Dr. Robert Falcone is a medical doctor, an artist, a musician and an entrepreneur. He is proposing to renovate an existing industrial building located at 254 S Grubb into a live/work unit including a private art gallery, living space, studio, workroom and two-car garage. The current structure is a one-story, concrete block building with a mezzanine. The studio and garage will be constructed as an addition to the original structure and will be located on 258 S Grubb with a new courtyard.

The design intent is to enhance the industrial character of the site while modifying the building into a functional living environment. The high bay space will be used as the owner's private art gallery and will retain the interior concrete block wall as a backdrop for the art collection. To insulate the space, the exterior of the building will be wrapped with a 2" rigid insulation and a 7/8" corrugated metal panel system. The existing entrance door and garage door located on Grubb Street will be covered by the metal panel and two new windows will be added to the west façade. Additional windows will also be added to the south façade. The north façade will provide an entry for guests covered by sliding barn doors that may only be opened from the inside. The design also includes a courtyard/outdoor sculpture gallery located on Grubb Street. The courtyard is enclosed by a perforated metal-panel fence that is eight-feet tall with a viewing window and front gate. With the perforation, the fence is approximately 60% opaque. New exterior lighting will be provided on all facades for security and illumination.

**Applicable Code Land Use Standard:**

Standard	Dodge Park District	Staff Comments
Live/Work	Permitted Use	Consistent

**Applicable Code Development Standards:**

Standard (All other uses)	Dodge Park District	Staff Comments
Minimum Front Yard	0'	Existing building: Consistent
Maximum Front Yard	10' (except w public-private zone)	Addition: Setback greater than 10'
Minimum Parking Setback	5'	Not under review
Minimum Side Yard	3'	10"
Minimum Fence/Wall Setback	0'	Consistent
Minimum Rear Yard	0' (or 15% - single/two family)	Consistent
Minimum Building Frontage	60%	~ 35%
Maximum Bldg Height	3 stories or 35'	Consistent
Building Frontage	All Buildings shall front on Public street	Primary entrance to rear and side of building
Lighting	Per C.C. 3323.21	Consistent
Graphics	Per C.C. 3323.21	Not under review
Parking, stacking, circulation	Not permitted between the principle building and right-of-way	Consistent
Parking	Live/work space 1 unit = 2 spaces	2 spaces provided

**Applicable Plan Land Use Recommendation:**

Standard	Dodge Park	Staff Comments
Medium-density mixed residential	6-10 du/acre New development should reinforce the existing pattern and type of residential construction in the neighborhood.	Consistent Reuse of industrial building

**Applicable Plan Development Standards:**

Recommendation	Standard	Staff Comments
Land Use Compatibility	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>When a proposed use is compatible with adjacent uses, it should be supported.</li> </ul>	Consistent
Architecture—Mixed-Use, Commercial, Multifamily and institutional buildings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Architecture should be provided that establishes and defines a building's appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>New construction should be integrated with the existing fabric and scale of development in surrounding neighborhoods.</li> </ul>	Recommend fence height to be lowered in order to integrate design with scale of the surrounding development and to consider relocation of primary entrance to Grubb Street.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A wide range of architectural styles are appropriate for East Franklinton, with preference for contemporary building design and materials.</li> </ul>	Consistent

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All sides of a building should be coherently designed and treated. A consistent level of detailing and finish should be provided for all sides of a building (“foursided” architecture).</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Building frontages that exceed 50 feet in width should consider using vertical piers or other vertical elements, spaced at intervals of 15 feet to 30 feet along the entire building elevation.</li> </ul>	Consider integration of vertical elements on north elevation.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Buildings with ground-floor residential spaces should have direct access to the public sidewalk and incorporate front stoops or small plazas to contribute to street activity. Multi-story buildings with residential units should incorporate balconies for the same reason.</li> </ul>	Primary entrance to rear and side of structure. Entrance on Grubb is accessed through a private courtyard that does not contribute to street activity. Recommend fence height to be lowered and provide primary entrance on Grubb Street.
Single and Two Family Uses	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The minimum setback for a principal single- and two family building should be zero feet and the maximum setback for a principal building should be ten feet from the public sidewalk.</li> </ul>	Addition on Grubb is setback greater than 10’ from the public sidewalk.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Accessory buildings (including, but not limited to, detached garages) should be located at the rear of the principal building (garages should not access directly onto public streets). A curb cut and driveway from a public street is only supportable were no alley exists.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The primary façade for single- and two-family buildings must abut a city street (i.e., be a building frontage).</li> </ul>	The private courtyard prevents the west façade from acting as the primary façade of the residence. Consider redesign of courtyard to provide a primary façade and entrance on city street.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>New housing should be compatible with nearby housing in terms of building height and width, building materials, porches, roof pitch, setbacks, and windows and door size, width, and spacing.</li> </ul>	Consistent. The reuse of an existing industrial building is compatible with the mix of commercial and residential uses on the street.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Single-family and two-family structures should include covered front porches that are at least eight feet deep.</li> </ul>	A covered porch is not compatible with the proposed design.
Site Design and Landscaping		
Building Orientation and Setbacks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Buildings should be located parallel to the street on which they front. The primary façade should be located on the major street abutting the building and the secondary façades should be located adjacent to secondary streets, service drives, and alleys. Buildings on corner lots should be oriented to the corner and to the street fronts, and should make a strong tie to the</li> </ul>	The private courtyard prevents the west façade from acting as the primary façade of the residence. Consider redesign of courtyard to provide a primary façade

	building lines of each street.	and entrance on city street.
Landscaping	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Landscape materials and design should enhance structures, create and define public and private spaces, and provide shade, aesthetic appeal, and environmental benefits.</li> </ul>	Consistent. Consider removing curb cut on Grubb Street.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Public, semi-public/private, and private spaces should be demarcated clearly through the use of landscape, walls, fences, gates, pavement treatment, signs, and other methods to denote boundaries and/or buffers.</li> </ul>	Consistent
Street Trees and Streetscape	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Landscaping on private property bordering sidewalks should be designed with new elements, such as a new plant form or material, at a scale and intervals appropriate to the site. This is not intended to discourage a uniform street tree or landscape theme, but to add interest to the streetscape and enhance the pedestrian experience.</li> </ul>	An eight-foot tall fence is not at an appropriate scale for the site. Staff recommends a reduction in height to enhance the pedestrian experience and provide a scale appropriate for the site.
Security	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Crime Prevention through Environmental Design (CPTED) measures should be incorporated, as necessary to reduce incidences of fear and crime, and design safer environments.</li> </ul>	The fence provides clear designation between public and private areas; however, it does not allow natural surveillance of the site, as defined by CPTED as allowing people engaged in normal activity to easily observe the space around them.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Development should be designed to encourage visible space that will serve as a means to discourage and to deter crime through the location of physical features, activities and people to maximize visibility.</li> </ul>	Provide more visibility to courtyard or consider redesign of courtyard as a more interior portion of the structure.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Landscaping and screening along property and parking lot perimeters should provide for visual openings into the site between three and eight feet above the sidewalk. This can be accomplished by staggering plantings and using walls and fences with openings.</li> </ul>	Staff recommends provision of additional visual openings in the fence above three feet.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Clear boundaries between public, semipublic/private, and private spaces should be defined.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• On-site lighting for security purposes should illuminate buildings and surfaces only, such as sidewalks and parking lots. Lighting should not be designed to illuminate the entire site, including adjacent property and rights-of-way, or the sky above the site.</li> </ul>	Consistent
Lighting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lighting should be appropriate to its location and utilized to enhance security and highlight distinguishing characteristics of buildings.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lights should have fully shielded, recessed lamps directed downward to prevent glare and shine above the horizontal plane.</li> </ul>	Consistent

Overall, the proposed design is consistent with the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan. The proposed change-of-use to a live/work unit is a permitted use for the Dodge Park sub-district and the building's architecture establishes and defines the building's appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton. The applicant is requesting modifications to the East Franklinton District for the following items:

1. Maximum front yard setback modified from 10' to 50'
2. Maximum side yard setback modified from 3' to 10'
3. Minimum building frontage modified from 60% to ~35%
4. Building frontage (front entry) to be provided to side or rear of building

Several design items are not consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan including:

1. *The primary entrance being located to the rear or side of the building*; The plan recommends that buildings with ground-floor residential spaces should have direct access to the public sidewalk and incorporate front stoops or small plazas to contribute to street activity. It also recommends that the primary façade should be located on the major street abutting the building. The height and opacity of the courtyard fence and the private nature of the courtyard prevent the Grubb Street entrance from acting as the primary entrance.

2. *A setback greater than 10' from the sidewalk on Grubb Street*; The plan recommends the maximum setback for a principal single- and two family building should be ten feet from the public sidewalk.

3. *A fence height that is not to scale with the site and detracts from the pedestrian experience*; The plan recommends landscaping on private property bordering sidewalks should be designed ... at a scale and intervals appropriate to the site. This is not intended to discourage a uniform street tree or landscape theme, but to add interest to the streetscape and enhance the pedestrian experience. The plan also recommends landscaping and screening along property and parking lot perimeters should provide for visual openings into the site between three and eight feet above the sidewalk and that development should be designed to encourage visible space that will serve as a means to discourage and to deter crime through the location of physical features, activities and people to maximize visibility.

4. *A lack of vertical elements on the north façade*; Building frontages that exceed 50 feet in width should consider using vertical piers or other vertical elements, spaced at intervals of 15 feet to 30 feet along the entire building elevation.

Staff recommends the courtyard fence height to be lowered and additional visibility provided into the courtyard in order to match the scale of the site, enhance the pedestrian experience and discourage crime through maximum visibility and natural surveillance of the site. As an alternative, consideration may be given to a design modification that increases the building frontage and provides a primary entrance on Grubb Street and reduces the building setback. Staff also recommends design consideration of vertical elements on the north façade.

Staff recommends approval with the condition to reduce the courtyard fence height and increase visibility of the courtyard. The Board may also consider a design modification as a condition of approval.

**Recommendations:**

Conceptual Approval

Approval

Approval with  
Conditions

Disapproval

**Conditions:**

1. Courtyard fence height reduced;
2. Courtyard fence visibility increased; and/or
3. Building design modification as determined by Board



**E      STAFF ISSUED CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL**

**F      BOARD APPROVED APPLICATIONS ISSUED CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL**

- 566 W Rich | Application #15-10-001
1.      Council Variance| Reviewed 10/20/2015 | Issued 10/21/2015 (Recommendation)  
566 W Rich | Application #15-10-001
2.      Parking Modification| Reviewed 10/20/2015 | Issued 10/21/2015  
532 and 536 W State | Application #15-10-002
3.      Demolition| Reviewed 10/20/2015 | Issued 10/21/2015  
577 W Town | Application #15-09-003
4.      Demolition| Reviewed 09/15/2015 | Issued 10/27/2015

**G      OTHER BUSINESS**

1.      Summary of CAMP training – Bill Fergus

**H      NEXT MEETING**

Tuesday – December 15, 2015 at 50 W Gay St at 3:00 pm.